

CONFIRMED

**THE UNIVERSITY OF MELBOURNE
TEACHING AND LEARNING QUALITY ASSURANCE COMMITTEE
MEETING 1/04**

A meeting of the Teaching and Learning Quality Assurance Committee was held at 2.15pm Thursday 5 February 2004 in the Jim Potter Room, Conference Centre, Old Physics Building, The University of Melbourne.

PRESENT

Members

Professor Leon Sterling (Chair), Professor Jeff Borland, Ms Gaby Bright, Professor Michael Bryan, Dr Mary Emison, Professor Graham Hutchinson, Associate Professor Carol Johnston, Associate Professor Jenny Lye, Professor Peter McPhee, Mr John Osborn, Professor Pip Pattison, Professor Field Rickards, Dr Ann Roberts, Professor Doris Young.

Observers

Associate Professor Su Baker, Ms Maddy McMaster.

By Invitation

Professor Brian Galligan and Professor Stuart Macintyre for item 6 only.

In Attendance

Ms Karen Roe (Committee Secretary).

BUSINESS

1. Formal Matters

1.1 Apologies

The Committee received apologies from Dr Mark Elgar, Professor Mary-Jane Gething, Professor Craig McInnis, Professor Alistair Moffat, Professor Terry Nolan, Ms Jenny Stephens, Mr Lachlan Williams and Professor Johanna Wyn.

1.2 Membership

The Committee welcomed the new Chair (Professor Leon Sterling), new members (Professor Jeff Borland, Professor Michael Bryan, Ms Gaby Bright, Professor Mary-Jane Gething, Professor Graham Hutchinson, Associate Professor Jenny Lye, Professor Pip Pattison) and a new observer representing the Faculty General Managers (Ms Maddy McMaster).

1.3 Attendance

The Committee welcomed Professor Stuart MacIntyre and Professor Brian Galligan to the meeting at 3.35pm for item 6 only.

2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

Minutes of the previous meeting held on Thursday 6 November 2003 were confirmed as an accurate record.

3. Matters Arising from the Minutes

3.1 Action Sheet

The Committee received and reviewed the action sheet from the previous meeting.

4. Teaching and Learning Management Plan 2004

The Committee received the University of Melbourne 'Teaching and Learning Management Plan 2004', and a verbal report from Professor McPhee outlining the priorities and actions for teaching and learning that pertain to TALQAC. The Committee discussed the strategies within the plan:

Strategy 2: relates to the reviews of academic programs. Professor McPhee requested the Secretary circulate the 'Nine principles guiding teaching and learning at the University of Melbourne' to the TALQAC committee, and place the document on the agenda for discussion at the next meeting.

Strategy 3: Australian universities will undergo a review of assessment practices in late 2004, and the Chair of the TALQAC Working Group on Assessment, Professor McInnis, will be the University's representative in the review process. It was noted the faculties of engineering and law have implemented formal English language testing of students. Students at risk are monitored for participation in support services, and this is reported to faculties. There was some discussion as to what was intended as the performance measure.

Strategy 4: the Committee will develop ways to reach key performance indicators of quality in teaching and learning that will be the basis of future Commonwealth performance based funding arrangements.

Strategy 9: if the University proceeds with online teaching and learning, the Committee must develop quality assessment measures.

Strategy 10: the Committee discussed the attainability of the objective to have 15 students or fewer in tutorials. The objective was expected to engender faculty discussion about resourcing issues.

5. Evaluation Cycle

5.1 Errors in Examination Papers for Semester 2, 2003

The Committee received from Student Administration a report, 'Statistical Data on Errors in Examination Papers for Semester 2, 2003' which will be circulated to Heads of Departments and the Academic Board. The Committee discussed whether it is desirable to continue generating such reports, and agreed the report is valuable, but it is also worth considering alternative measures of errors in examination papers than the current percentage. In preparation for further discussion at the next meeting, the Committee requested an additional report from Student Administration with statistical data on errors in examination papers by faculty and department from 2001-2003, as well as the Academic Board policy guiding invigilators in grading errors.

The Committee noted the Australian Universities Quality Agency will audit the University in 2005. The audit will involve a site visit and self-assessment, so TALQAC, Academic Programs Committee and Selection Procedures Committee will be required to exemplify best practice in quality auditing processes, and this report may be used as an example.

5.2 Free-Form Comments Received with the 2002 Course Experience Questionnaire

The Committee received from the University Planning Office a report on 'Free-Form Comments Received with the 2002 Course Experience Questionnaire' and a covering

memorandum from Dr Emison dated 6 January 2004. Dr Emison verbally reported that recipients of the Course Experience Questionnaire were surveyed 4-5 months after the completion of a degree. Their free-form comments within the survey were compiled into this report. The University Planning Office will compare these comments with those received in the 'Survey of graduates on the quality of their courses and experiences'. The report is expected to be utilised at a faculty level. The Committee thanked the University Planning Office for providing such a useful document.

6. Performance Based Research Evaluation in New Zealand

The Committee received a verbal report from Professor MacIntyre and Professor Galligan on the performance based research evaluation process in New Zealand. Unlike the Australian system that awards funding based on measures such as publications and competitive grants, the New Zealand System ranks academic staff on the quality of their research output, peer esteem and contribution to research infrastructure. The grading of individuals from A 'world class' to R 'research inactive' becomes the basis of a mathematical calculation of funding for each department. Professional disciplines rate low, but have institutional esteem, while arts rates low overall. It was speculated that such grading will influence employment and promotions, and may encourage the relegation of teaching duties to low ranking staff so as to relieve high performance research staff. Concern was expressed that such grading devalues teaching, because teaching staff may be classified as 'research inactive', and evaluates outcome rather than opportunity, so new starters and those with broken careers may be marginalised.

7. Working Groups and Discussion Groups

The Chair announced that a review of TALQAC working groups will be conducted at the next meeting. He proposed a working group on best practice in intellectual property management in relation to teaching. Professor McPhee proposed a working group to evaluate the quality of teaching in an international context. The Chair requested the Secretary place a list of working groups and members on the next agenda, and invited the members to bring suggestions for new working groups to the next meeting.

7.1 Working Group on Minor Thesis

The Committee received from Dr Emison a paper, 'Minor Thesis Survey Pilot Study'. The Working Group on Minor Thesis conducted the pilot survey of the quality of the learning experience for students undertaking a minor thesis (honours and postgraduate coursework) in the faculties of arts, economics and commerce, and education in late 2003. The majority of those surveyed were honours students. The survey revealed the majority of respondents were satisfied with the level of supervision. Another survey will be conducted in 2004. The full report is expected to be presented to the April meeting.

7.2 Working Group on Field Placements

The Committee received a draft report, 'TALQAC Working Group on Field Placements', by Professor Galligan, and a verbal progress report on the Working Group from Professor Pattison. The Committee **approved** the recommendations in the report that:

- a. each faculty have a policy covering all its off-campus placements and internships that ensures quality control procedures and is consistent with overall university policy.
- b. each faculty review regularly its existing programs and subjects with off-campus placements and internship components to ensure compliance with their policy.
- c. Academic Programs Committee ensure as part of the approval process that all new programs and subjects with off-campus components have appropriate quality control procedures, including clear specification of assessment, in compliance with their faculty's policy.

- d. TALQAC include quality assurance of teaching and learning for off-campus placements and fieldwork in its review audits.
- e. no exceptions be made to exempt off-campus teaching and learning from compliance with faculty policy, student evaluation and TALQAC review.
- f. where the standard quality of teaching questionnaire is not suited to particular instances, that variations of quality of teaching or alternative equivalent instruments be designed, in consultation with TALQAC, the University Planning Office and the Centre for the Study of Higher Education.

Professor McPhee undertook to circulate the Working Group report, and the draft 'Off-Campus Travel and Work Policy' by the Risk Management Office, to Associate Deans and bring their comments back to the Committee. The Committee resolved to forward the Working Group report to the Academic Board together with the 'Off-Campus Travel and Work Policy' by the Risk Management Office when the policy has been approved by Council.

7.3 Working Group on Assessment

The Committee received from Professor Sterling a verbal report on the progress of the Working Group on Assessment. The Working Group is collaborating with the TALMET Working Group on Assessment, which is working on quality assurance for on-line assessment, and the APC Working Group on Assessment Parameters and Course Load. All three working groups have written a draft report and expect to finalise these for forwarding to the Academic Board in April 2004.

7.4 Working Group on Academic Honesty

The Committee received from Professor McPhee a verbal report on the implementation at the University of the plagiarism detection software available through www.turnitin.com. A contract will be signed shortly including an agreement that submissions will be deleted from the system every 18 months. Enrolment forms, student diaries and essay submission forms will advise students that submissions may be screened for possible plagiarism. Information Division will employ a staff member to educate staff and students about the system and promote academic honesty. The Committee agreed the Working Group should develop a policy for plagiarism detection screening.

7.5 Discussion Group on Postgraduate Coursework

The Committee received from Professor McPhee a paper, 'Evaluation of Postgraduate Coursework Teaching Sessions at the 2003 Vice-Chancellor's Colloquium'.

8. Other Business

Nil.

9. Next Meeting

The Committee noted the next meeting will be held at 2.15pm Thursday 11 March 2004 in the Jim Potter Conference Room, Old Physics Building, The University of Melbourne.

The meeting closed at 4.10pm.

DISTRIBUTION

Members

Complete agenda papers – hard copy distribution

Professor Leon Sterling, Department of Computer Science and Software Engineering - CHAIR

Professor Jeff Borland, Head, Department of Economics

Ms Gaby Bright, University of Melbourne Postgraduate Association
Professor Michael Bryan, Deputy Dean, Faculty of Law, and Chair, Academic Programs Committee
Mr Scott Crawford, Melbourne University Student Union
Dr Mark A. Elgar, Associate Professor, Department of Zoology
Dr Mary R. Emison, Director, University Planning Office
Professor Mary-Jane Gething, Department of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology
Professor Graham Hutchinson, Deputy Dean, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering
Associate Professor Carol Johnston, Director, Teaching and Learning Unit, Faculty of Economics and Commerce
Associate Professor Jenny Lye, Department of Economics
Professor Craig McInnis, Director, Centre for the Study of Higher Education – DEPUTY CHAIR
Professor Peter McPhee, Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Academic), Department of History
Professor Alistair Moffat, Department of Computer Science and Software Engineering
Professor Terry Nolan, Head, School of Population Health
Mr John Osborn, Vice-President and Education Officer, Melbourne University Student Union
Professor Pip Pattison, Head, School of Behavioural Science, and Deputy Vice-President of the Academic Board
Professor Field Rickards, President of the Academic Board, Department of Learning and Educational Development
Dr Ann Roberts, Department of Physics
Ms Jenny Stephens, Director, Academic Services (Student Programs)
Associate Professor Peter Tregloan, School of Chemistry
Mr Lachlan Williams, President, University of Melbourne Postgraduate Association
Professor Johanna Wyn, Head, Education Policy and Management
Professor Doris Young, Department of General Practice

Observer

Complete agenda papers – hard copy distribution

Associate Professor Su Baker, Head, School of Art, Victorian College of the Arts
Ms Maddy McMaster, General Manager, Faculty of Education

In Attendance

Complete agenda papers, spare copy and originals – hard copy distribution

Ms Karen Roe, Committee Secretary, Central Secretariat, University Secretary's Department (x47528, k.roe@unimelb.edu.au)

For Information

Complete agenda papers – hard copy distribution

Mr Russell Hillbrich, General Manager, Student Administration
Mr Ian Marshman, Senior Vice-Principal

Complete agenda papers – original copy to Secretary

Central Records, University Secretary's Department

Agenda (without attached papers) and confirmed minutes – electronic distribution

Ms Janet Beard, General Manager, Institute of Land and Food Resources
Mr Lachlan Cameron, Director, Student Administration and Systems, Academic Services
Ms Elizabeth Capp, General Manager, Faculty of Architecture, Building and Planning
Ms Suzanne Dixon, General Manager, Faculty of Economics and Commerce
Mr Richard Frampton, General Manager, Faculty of Medicine, Dentistry and Health Sciences
Ms Helen Hayes, Vice-Principal (Information)
Ms Elizabeth Lightfoot, General Manager, Faculty of Veterinary Science
Ms Lin Martin, Vice-Principal and Academic Registrar
Mr Robert Northey, General Manager, Faculty of Music
Ms Joan Reese, General Manager, Faculty of Engineering
Professor Paul Rizzo, Director, Melbourne Business School
Dr Christopher Stewardson, General Manager, Faculty of Science
Mrs Penny Swain, General Manager, Faculty of Law
Ms Lynne Wrout, General Manager, Faculty of Arts

Ms Fiona Zammit, General Manager, School of Graduate Studies

Karen Roe 11.00am 18/3/04, LS 11/2/04, TALQAC 2004\minutes\TALQAC minutes1.04